# ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE IN EDUCATION: A REVIEW OF EMERGING TRENDS, CHALLENGES, AND OPPORTUNITIES

# Navpreet Kaur

Assistant Professor, Lovely Professional University

# **Mamta Sambyal**

Research Scholar, Lovely Professional University

#### Krishan Gopal

Associate Professor, Lovely Professional University

#### **ABSTRACT**

This paper synthesizes secondary literature on artificial intelligence (AI) in education between 2015 and 2025, drawing from peer-reviewed journals, conference proceedings, and organizational reports. It explores emerging trends, challenges, and opportunities, with key themes such as adaptive and personalized learning, intelligent tutoring systems, learning analytics, ethical considerations, teacher readiness, and equity and inclusion. The review highlights the substantial potential of AI to improve learning outcomes, engagement, and efficiency, while exposing critical gaps: insufficient long-term, large-scale empirical research; uneven global coverage; limited focus on ethics, transparency, and data privacy; and poor integration of AI concepts into teacher education and policy frameworks. The abstract concludes with directions for future research to address these deficiencies.

**Keywords**: Artificial Intelligence, Education, Higher Education, Learning, Teaching, Assessment, Adaptive Learning

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

Artificial Intelligence (AI) stands as one of the defining technological advancements of the 21st century, fundamentally reshaping numerous sectors, with education experiencing profound effects. With the advent of greater computational power, accessibility to vast datasets, and advancement in both machine learning algorithms and large language models, educational technologies now offer significant potential for transformation across learning environments (Hagos *et al.*, 2024). These innovations have enabled personalized learning pathways, intelligent feedback mechanisms, streamlined assessments, and improved educational decision-making in contexts ranging from K-12 schools to higher education and lifelong learning settings.(Garzón *et al.*, 2025; Wang, 2024, and Chiu *et al.*, 2023).

Current AI applications in education include adaptive learning systems, intelligent tutoring systems (ITS), chatbots for student engagement, tools for advanced data analytics, and automations enhancing administrative efficiency. Substantial literature highlights improvements in educational efficiency, scalability, tailored learning experiences, and overall student outcomes (Chiu *et al.*, 2023; Xu & Ouyang, 2022). Notably, these technologies hold exceptional promise for expanding accessibility and closing educational gaps (Chiu *et al.*, 2023).

However, the rapid pace of AI adoption has surfaced persistent and nuanced challenges. Key concerns include algorithmic bias, privacy and data ownership, inequitable access to technological resources, lack of sufficient teacher training, variable acceptance among

educators, and limited transparency in efficacy evaluations (Garzón et al., 2025; Wang, 2024; Yan, 2025). Moreover, policy and governance frameworks often lag behind technological innovation, complicating effective integration and oversight (Cardona, 2023).

Given the surge of generative AI and large language models in recent years, a review of the literature is both timely and necessary. This review synthesizes the latest findings from empirical studies and industry reports, identifies the major opportunities and challenges currently faced by educators and policymakers, and proposes directions for future research and policy development aimed at harnessing the transformative potential of AI while mitigating risks.

#### 2. REVIEW OF LITERATURE

The integration of AI into education has attracted substantial scholarly attention due to its potential to transform traditional teaching and learning processes. This section synthesizes recent secondary literature on AI in education.

# 2.1 AI for personalized and adaptive learning

The discussion on AI in education includes both remarkable prospects for personalised learning and considerable obstacles with algorithmic biases, data privacy, and pedagogical alignment (Gutiérrez et al., 2025). This study consolidates findings from several studies, emphasising how AI may improve learning effectiveness and personalise educational experiences, while also examining the ethical challenges associated with its use. The most extensively investigated application of AI in education is personalized learning. Pratama et al. (2023) assert that AI has the capacity to fundamentally revolutionise educational methodologies by personalizing the learning experience to align with the distinct needs of students. This individualized approach enhances student engagement and leads to better academic results. Through systematic analysis of performance data, AI-enabled systems can dynamically adjust instructional content, control the learning pace, and enhance evaluation methods to maximize educational efficacy (Wang et al., 2024). Through ongoing assessment and analysis of student performance, AI algorithms are capable of pinpointing specific weaknesses and offering tailored interventions to effectively address these challenges. This tailored method enhances educational results while fostering student involvement and enthusiasm (Akavova et al., 2023). A research by Dutta et al. (2024) has investigated the function of AI-driven adaptive learning platforms (ALPs) in enhancing individualized education, focusing on systems like Carnegie Learning, DreamBox Learning, Smart Sparrow, and Knewton. These platforms exhibit diverse methodologies for material customization, feedback provision, and student involvement, providing insights into their capacity to enhance educational results. The literature concurrently recognizes apprehensions about bias, data privacy, and the changing responsibilities of educators in technology-enhanced classrooms Personalized learning environments enhance engagement and offer tailored support to students with diverse learning requirements (Ayeni et al., 2024). This personalized training increasingly aligns with constructivist educational approaches, highlighting learnercentered experiences and results (Jian, 2023). The spectrum of AI applications in education is extensive, including the automation of administrative tasks, the enhancement of personalized learning, and the provision of decision-making assistance for instructors (Pratama et al., 2023). Recent evaluations indicate that AI-driven solutions can substantially enhance student engagement, accomplishment, and retention via personalized education and adaptive feedback mechanisms (Garzón et al., 2025). By alleviating tedious administrative tasks, AI enables educators to focus more on pedagogy and student engagement (Chiu et al., 2023).

#### 2.2 Ethical and governance challenges in AI

The integration of AI in education has garnered increasing academic interest since 2015, with a growing body of research emphasizing its transformative capabilities and the ethical dilemmas it presents. The adoption of AI technology in the examination of educational data presents considerable ethical and privacy issues. Given that these systems generally necessitate access to substantial amounts of sensitive information regarding students and teachers, the problems related to confidentiality and data protection become especially prominent (Kim et al., 2024), Therefore, matters concerning privacy, informed permission, and the prudent management of educational data must be meticulously addressed in the design of both research projects and practical implementations of AI in education (AIEd) (Chen et al., 2020). Recent research indicate that applications like automated content generation, adaptive assessments, and personalized learning platforms are especially promising for increasing student engagement and promoting academic performance (Ray, 2023). Simultaneously, these developments present substantial ethical dilemmas that necessitate rigorous scrutiny. The primary concern is academic integrity, especially with AI-The advent of generative models like ChatGPT has heightened generated content. discussions on authorship, originality, and intellectual integrity, prompting unresolved inquiries about whether AI-generated content can be considered genuine contributions or ethically questionable outputs (Dwivedi et al., 2023). This highlights the urgent necessity for transparent laws and explicit ethical standards to govern the responsible application of AI in education. The ethical implications of AI in education go beyond the authenticity of student work, addressing wider concerns of governance, pedagogy, and accountability (Mennella, 2024). Researchers have underscored the necessity of incorporating ethical considerations into decision-making processes for AI implementation in educational settings, ensuring that technology advancements are consistent with established pedagogical objectives and ethical standards (Eden et al., 2024). Studies have demonstrated that AI is transforming the dynamics of learner-instructor interactions. Although AI-driven tutoring systems, chatbots, and feedback mechanisms provide avenues for tailored academic assistance, they also pose risks of depersonalization, diminished human interaction, and the perpetuation of algorithmic prejudice (Cirillo, 2025). These hazards underscore the dual-edged nature of AI: it has the potential to democratize access to educational resources, yet it may potentially intensify existing disparities if deployed without meticulous control (Ray, 2023).

# 2.3 Stakeholder preparedness and readiness for AI integration

The effective incorporation of AI in education depends on the preparedness of essential stakeholders, such as students, educators, administrators, and policymakers (Chen *et al.*, 2020). Current research indicates significant variations in preparation among these categories, highlighting the inconsistent ability of the educational system to respond to technological advancements. Educators sometimes necessitate both technical training and pedagogical assistance to properly incorporate AI tools into teaching and learning processes (Alfredo *et al.*, 2023). At the institutional and policy levels, administrators and decision-makers must navigate the problem of reconciling enthusiasm for innovation with the prudent assessment of potential dangers, including data privacy violations and the requirements of regulatory compliance. Nursing education exemplifies the necessity for AI integration to encompass not only technological implementation but also the development of ethical literacy in future healthcare practitioners (Xu & Ouyang, 2022). This collection of research collectively emphasizes that stakeholder preparedness is not solely a technological concern but also a

pedagogical and ethical necessity that influences the efficacy of AI implementation in education.

# 2.4 AI and institutional challenges

Institutional challenges also contribute to the restriction of AI implementation in education. Resistance to change, limited financial resources, and infrastructural limitations present substantial challenges, especially in developing contexts (Chiu *et al.*, 2023). Furthermore, enquiries regarding the pedagogical validity of AI tools remain unanswered. Certain studies indicate short-term enhancements in student involvement; however, the evidence on long-term learning advancements remains inconclusive (Létourneau *et al.*, 2025). These findings highlight the necessity of undertaking longitudinal research to evaluate the enduring effects of AI-enhanced education.

# 2.5 Policy and educational frameworks in AI

To address these opportunities and problems, experts have suggested policy frameworks that prioritise governance and pedagogy. These frameworks promote the responsible integration of AI, the protection of data privacy, and the alignment of AI tools with educational objectives rather than being purely influenced by technological capabilities (Garzón *et al.*, 2025). Universities are being strongly encouraged to design AI policies that emphasise student learning results while integrating ethical concepts into their institutional initiatives (Wang *et al.*, 2024).

#### 2.6 Prospective opportunities and future trajectories in AI

Despite ongoing hurdles, AI offers significant prospects for transforming education. In addition to personalisation, AI may facilitate career preparedness through advanced career counselling tools, promote fairness by delivering scalable tutoring assistance, and foster novel teaching methods such as AI-enhanced simulations and AR/VR-based immersive learning experiences (Yan, 2025). Researchers predict that the forthcoming decade will experience heightened integration of generative AI models, hybrid AI–AR/VR platforms, and human-centered learning analytics, potentially transforming the distinctions between formal and informal education (Alfredo *et al.*, 2023).

In summary, the literature indicates that AI in education is a domain marked by swift expansion and considerable potential, however it also faces substantial ethical and institutional obstacles. The advantages of AI, such as personalisation, efficiency, and engagement, are well acknowledged; yet, its effective implementation relies on resolving governance issues, guaranteeing equal access, and equipping stakeholders for responsible integration. This developing dialogue highlights the necessity for interdisciplinary cooperation, strong ethical guidelines, and ongoing research to fully harness AI's transformative capabilities in education.

#### 3. OBJECTIVES

- To delineate the current literature regarding AI applications in education, emphasising the key technologies, educational levels, domains, and outcomes.
- To ascertain the primary challenges and ethical issues related to the implementation of AI in educational settings.
- To investigate opportunities and recommend future research avenues and policy implications for the responsible and effective utilisation of AI in education.

#### 4. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The research methodology for the current study has been explained below:

# 4.1 Research design

This study utilised an organised evaluation of secondary literature, including meta-analyses, narrative reviews, and empirical studies published from 2015 to 2025. The research design focused on integrating existing information about AI applications in education, emerging trends, related issues, and future research directions. Cooper's (1988) methodology for synthesising literature was utilised to direct the review process. This methodology had five sequential steps: (a) identifying the research topic, (b) gathering pertinent literature, (c) assessing the relevance and quality of the studies, (d) analysing and interpreting the findings, and (e) organising and presenting the results. This structured methodology for a thorough and systematic synthesis of previous studies, yielding significant insights on the role of AI in education.

# 4.2 Data sources & search strategy

Peer-reviewed publications were identified from databases including Web of Science, Scopus, IEEE Xplore, SpringerLink, ScienceDirect, and other relevant sources. Also included were authoritative reports (UNESCO, OECD) and recent ethical review papers. Search terms included combinations of, "artificial intelligence in education", "AI in education", "intelligent tutoring systems", "adaptive learning", "learning analytics", "ethical AI", "teacher readiness", "AI assessment", etc.

#### 5. FINDINGS

Literature research reveals that AI applications in education yield favorable results regarding student learning, engagement, and customisation. Artificial intelligence in education is a burgeoning field of research with significant potential across various aspects. The integration of AI in education offers numerous advantageous prospects that, when utilized judiciously, could markedly improve both learning and teaching outcomes.

#### 5.1 Application and trends

The review of literature underscores various significant uses and developments regarding the utilization of AI in education. Adaptive and personalized learning systems continue to be a primary emphasis, featuring tools that customize information, pacing, and interaction according to individual student requirements. Garzón *et al.* (2025) illustrate the application of AI in analyzing teacher-student interactions, classroom discourse, and collaborative activities to facilitate personalization. Intelligent Tutoring Systems (ITS) remain a focal point of academic inquiry; a systematic assessment of 28 ITS research in K-12 by Létourneau *et al.* (2025) indicated predominantly favorable impacts on student learning and performance, while the robustness and effect sizes differed between contexts.

Learning analytics and human-centered AI design signify an emerging trend, as highlighted by Alfredo *et al.* (2023), who observe advancements in involving stakeholders, including educators and learners, in the design process; nonetheless, numerous systems continue to inadequately address safety, reliability, and trustworthiness. Simultaneously, the automation of assessment and feedback has accelerated, with generative AI, large language models (LLMs), and automated grading systems being widely utilized to deliver feedback, produce content, and enhance evaluation processes. Yan *et al.* (2023) conducted a scoping review that revealed 53 unique applications of LLMs in education, while also emphasizing persistent

issues of openness, fairness, and replicability. These innovations are starting to transform educational practices, albeit their ethical and pedagogical ramifications necessitate thorough examination.

### 5.2 Challenges

The incorporation of AI in education presents considerable ethical and data-related problems that are inadequately addressed in the existing literature. AI models often display biases that may favour specific demographic groups, prompting issues around justice, equity, and inclusivity (Garzón *et al.*, 2025). Challenges are exacerbated by concerns around student data privacy, ownership, and security, especially in environments with inadequate legislative frameworks. Yan's (2025) study of AI ethics emphasizes that although these challenges are frequently recognized, they are hardly scrutinized through rigorous empirical research, underscoring the pressing necessity for enhanced governance frameworks and transparent operating methods.

A significant portion of the current research is restricted to small-scale or short-term investigations, frequently lacking extensive replication or follow-up. Although techniques like ITS have shown favourable short-term results, there is few data indicating that these improvements are sustained over time. Létourneau *et al.* (2025) observe that the lack of longitudinal studies limits the capacity to comprehensively evaluate long-term effects on information retention, motivation, and learning trajectories. The limited evidence base obstructs generalizability and policymaking, raising unresolved issues regarding the sustainability and scalability of AI-enhanced educational methods.

Geographical and socio-economic differences intensify these constraints. The majority of research is conducted in industrialized countries, where technological infrastructure and financial resources are relatively plentiful. Conversely, low- and middle-income nations are markedly underrepresented in the literature, despite confronting severe educational issues that AI may possibly mitigate. This disparity restricts comprehension of how AI technology can be tailored to resource-limited situations, varied cultural contexts, and multilingual scenarios.

Ultimately, obstacles concerning teacher readiness, curricular coherence, and infrastructural limitations persist as significant impediments to AI implementation. Numerous instructors indicate inadequate training, a deficiency of confidence in utilizing AI tools, and restricted professional development chances for the meaningful integration of these technologies into their instruction (Alfredo *et al.*, 2023). Moreover, extensive implementation is obstructed by infrastructural and budgetary constraints, including the necessity for dependable internet access, contemporary gear, and ongoing institutional backing.

#### 5.3 Opportunities

Despite ongoing hurdles, AI offers significant prospects for transforming education. Crucial technologies, like ITS, adaptive learning platforms, and learning analytics, have shown the capacity to augment personalization, boost educational results, and deliver real-time feedback to students and educators. In addition to personalisation, AI may facilitate career preparedness through advanced career counselling tools, promote fairness by delivering scalable tutoring assistance, and foster novel teaching methods such as AI-enhanced simulations and AR/VR-based immersive learning experiences (Yan, 2025). Researchers predict that the forthcoming decade will experience heightened integration of generative AI models, hybrid AI–AR/VR platforms, and human-centered learning analytics, potentially transforming the distinctions between formal and informal education (Alfredo *et al.*, 2023). AI systems may customize learning trajectories, tempo, and material to accommodate

individual learners, thus addressing varied requirements and fostering inclusivity. In addition to individualization, AI provides scalability, facilitating the delivery of quality education to a greater number of pupils, especially in environments experiencing teacher shortages. AI can enhance productivity for educators by automating routine administrative and assessment duties, thereby liberating time for more creative, interpersonal, and educational activities. Moreover, predictive analytics and learning analytics offer robust instruments for early identification and intervention, enabling institutions to recognize at-risk students and track progress in real time. Evidence indicates that AI can facilitate not only assessment but also enhance pedagogical processes, including promoting cooperation, emotionally engaging learners, and directing adaptive training.

#### 6. CONCLUSION

This review highlights that Artificial Intelligence in education is a swiftly evolving domain with considerable transformative capacity. Crucial technologies, including intelligent tutoring systems, adaptive learning platforms, and learning analytics, are currently exhibiting beneficial impacts on student engagement, personalised instruction, and institutional efficiency. Simultaneously, significant challenges endure, encompassing ethical dilemmas associated with bias, privacy, and transparency; equity concerns arising from disparate access and socio-economic inequalities; and deficiencies in teacher preparedness, curriculum integration, and policy governance. Opportunities exist in utilising AI to enhance inclusivity, facilitate career preparedness, and cultivate innovative teaching methods, while emerging trends—such as generative AI, large language models, and hybrid multimodal systems integrating AI with AR/VR—present new avenues for investigation. To maximise AI's potential in education, stakeholders must prioritise comprehensive and longitudinal empirical research, establish strong ethical and regulatory frameworks, invest in teacher training and stakeholder involvement, and tailor AI adoption strategies to varied local contexts. AI can only be established as a sustainable catalyst for equitable and significant educational transformation through a balanced approach that merges technological innovation with ethical responsibility and pedagogical alignment.

#### 8. FUTURE RESEARCH DIRECTIONS

The current literature underscores multiple pathways for future research that can promote the responsible incorporation of AI in education. The forthcoming research agenda should emphasize longitudinal and extensive investigations that assess the enduring effects on learning outcomes, motivation, and well-being. It should also broaden to encompass a wider array of socio-economic and geographical situations, particularly low-resource settings where the obstacles to AI adoption may vary considerably. The establishment of ethical, transparent, and equitable frameworks for the responsible governance of AI usage is equally crucial. Furthermore, the literature is predominantly focused on research in industrialized nations, resulting in considerable gaps concerning the problems and prospects of AI implementation in low- and middle-income countries or resource-limited rural areas. This disparity prompts inquiries regarding the universal relevance of findings and underscores the necessity for more comprehensive and inclusive research.

Educators are crucial facilitators in the integration of AI; nevertheless, their viewpoints, professional growth, and acceptance of these technologies are sometimes inadequately considered. Inadequate training and misalignment with educational theory may hinder instructors' ability to properly integrate AI into classrooms. Teacher education and stakeholder participation are essential domains, guaranteeing that AI technologies are

collaboratively developed with educators and students and effectively incorporated into courses. Emergent AI technologies, particularly large language models (LLMs), signify a novel and swiftly evolving domain. They have substantial prospects for feedback production, content creation, and personalization; nevertheless, they also elicit worries about accuracy, bias, misuse, and plagiarism. These instruments require thorough examination prior to their complete integration into educational practice in a safe, equitable, and successful manner.

Moreover, assessments of generative AI in genuine educational environments and investigations of hybrid models integrating ITS, AR/VR, multimodal data, and human interaction will probably shape the forthcoming wave of innovation.

# **REFERENCES**

- 1. Akavova, A., Temirkhanova, Z., & Lorsanova, Z. (2023). Adaptive learning and artificial intelligence in the educational space. In *E3S web of conferences* (Vol. 451, p. 06011). EDP Sciences.
- 2. Alfredo, R., Echeverria, V., Jin, Y., Yan, L., Swiecki, Z., Gašević, D., & Martinez-Maldonado, R. (2024). Human-centred learning analytics and AI in education: A systematic literature review. *Computers and Education: Artificial Intelligence*, 6, 100215.
- 3. Ayeni, O. O., Al Hamad, N. M., Chisom, O. N., Osawaru, B., & Adewusi, O. E. (2024). AI in education: A review of personalized learning and educational technology. *GSC Advanced Research and Reviews*, 18(2), 261-271.
- 4. Cardona, M. A. (2023). Artificial intelligence and the future of teaching and learning.
- 5. Chen, X., Xie, H., Zou, D., & Hwang, G. J. (2020). Application and theory gaps during the rise of artificial intelligence in education. *Computers and Education: Artificial Intelligence*, 1, 100002.
- 6. Chiu, T. K., Xia, Q., Zhou, X., Chai, C. S., & Cheng, M. (2023). Systematic literature review on opportunities, challenges, and future research recommendations of artificial intelligence in education. *Computers and Education: Artificial Intelligence*, 4, 100118.
- 7. Cirillo, C. (2025). "ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE" IN EDUCATION: A RESOURCE OR A THREAT TO OUR FUTURE?. In *EDULEARN25 Proceedings* (pp. 9302-9311). IATED.
- 8. Cooper, H. M. (1988). Organizing knowledge syntheses: A taxonomy of literature reviews. *Knowledge in society*, *I*(1), 104.
- 9. Dutta, S., Ranjan, S., Mishra, S., Sharma, V., Hewage, P., & Iwendi, C. (2024, February). Enhancing educational adaptability: A review and analysis of AI-driven adaptive learning platforms. In 2024 4th International Conference on Innovative Practices in Technology and Management (ICIPTM) (pp. 1-5). IEEE.
- 10. Dwivedi, Y. K., Kshetri, N., Hughes, L., Slade, E. L., Jeyaraj, A., Kar, A. K., ... & Wright, R. (2023). Opinion Paper: "So what if ChatGPT wrote it?" Multidisciplinary perspectives on opportunities, challenges and implications of generative conversational AI for research, practice and policy. *International journal of information management*, 71, 102642.

- 11. Eden, C. A., Chisom, O. N., & Adeniyi, I. S. (2024). Integrating AI in education: Opportunities, challenges, and ethical considerations. *Magna Scientia Advanced Research and Reviews*, 10(2), 006-013.
- 12. Garzón, J., Patiño, E., & Marulanda, C. (2025). Systematic Review of Artificial Intelligence in Education: Trends, Benefits, and Challenges. *Multimodal Technologies and Interaction*, 9(8), 84.
- 13. Gutierrez, J. C., Chiappe, A., Becerra Rodríguez, D. F., & González Pérez, L. I. (2025). The Transformative Journey of Artificial Intelligence Toward Personalized Learning. *The New Educator*, 1-19.
- 14. Hagos, D. H., Battle, R., & Rawat, D. B. (2024). Recent advances in generative ai and large language models: Current status, challenges, and perspectives. *IEEE transactions on artificial intelligence*.
- 15. Jian, M. J. K. O. (2023). Personalized learning through AI. *Advances in Engineering Innovation*, 5(1), 16-19.
- 16. Kim, D., Zhu, Q., & Eldardiry, H. (2024). Toward a policy approach to normative artificial intelligence governance: Implications for AI Ethics Education. *IEEE Transactions on Technology and Society*.
- 17. Létourneau, A., Deslandes Martineau, M., Charland, P., Karran, J. A., Boasen, J., & Léger, P. M. (2025). A systematic review of AI-driven intelligent tutoring systems (ITS) in K-12 education. *npj Science of Learning*, *10*(1), 29.
- 18. Mennella, C., Maniscalco, U., De Pietro, G., & Esposito, M. (2024). Ethical and regulatory challenges of AI technologies in healthcare: A narrative review. *Heliyon*, 10(4).
- 19. Pratama, M. P., Sampelolo, R., & Lura, H. (2023). Revolutionizing education: harnessing the power of artificial intelligence for personalized learning. *Klasikal: Journal of education, language teaching and science*, 5(2), 350-357.
- 20. Ray, P. P. (2023). ChatGPT: A comprehensive review on background, applications, key challenges, bias, ethics, limitations and future scope. *Internet of Things and Cyber-Physical Systems*, *3*, 121-154.
- 21. Wang, S., Wang, F., Zhu, Z., Wang, J., Tran, T., & Du, Z. (2024). Artificial intelligence in education: A systematic literature review. *Expert Systems with Applications*, 252, 124167.
- 22. Xu, W., & Ouyang, F. (2022). The application of AI technologies in STEM education: a systematic review from 2011 to 2021. *International Journal of STEM Education*, 9(1), 59.
- 23. Yan, Y., Liu, H., & Chau, T. (2025). A Systematic Review of AI Ethics in Education: Challenges, Policy Gaps, and Future Directions. *Journal of Global Information Management (JGIM)*, 33(1), 1-50.